## **CLIMATE JUSTICE**

## Case Studies in Global and Regional Governance Challenges

Randall S. Abate, Editor

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW INSTITUTE Washington, D.C.

Copyright © 2016 Environmental Law Institute 1730 M Street NW, Washington, DC 20036

Published December 2016.

Cover design by A.J.-Miles Media, Inc. www.ajmilesmedia.com

Printed in the United States of America ISBN 978-1-58576-XXX-X

For present and future generations throughout the world who are suffering from or live in fear of their vulnerability to climate change impacts.

## **C**ontents

Editor and (	ontributor Biographies
Acknowledg	mentsxxv
Introduction	ıxxvii
UNIT I:	International Governance Perspectives
Chapter 1:	Damilola S. Olawuyi, Advancing Climate Justice in National Climate Actions: The Promise and Limitations of the United Nations Human Rights-based Approach
Chapter 2:	Patrícia G. Ferreira, From Justice to Participation: The Paris Agreement's Pragmatic Approach to Differentiation
Chapter 3:	Steven Ferrey, The Green Climate Fund, International Governance, and Climate Justice in Developing Nations
Chapter 4:	Ara Azad & Ava Azad, Energy Access, Climate  Justice, and Financing Innovation
Chapter 5:	Josephine M. Balzac, Corporate Responsibility: Promoting Climate Justice Through the Divestment of Fossil Fuels and Socially Responsible Investment 125
Chapter 6:	William C.G. Burns, Human Rights Dimensions of Bioenergy With Carbon Capture and Storage:  A Framework for Climate Justice in the Realm of Climate Geoengineering
Unit II:	North American Perspectives
Chapter 7:	Keith W. Rizzardi, Flee the Rising Sea? South Florida's Choice of Leadership or Litigation173

vi Climate Justice

Chapter 8:	David Roche, The Seas Are Rising and So Are Community Voices: Coastal Resilience and Climate Justice Through Public Participation After the Deepwater Horizon Oil Spill
Chapter 9:	Cameron Jefferies, Justice in an Unconventional World: First Nations' Treaty Rights and Procedural Climate Justice in Alberta's Oil Sands Region233
Chapter 10:	Itzchak Kornfeld, The Impact of Climate Change on American and Canadian Indigenous Peoples and Their Water Resources: A Climate Justice Perspective265
UNIT III:	ISLAND NATION PERSPECTIVES
Chapter 11:	Sumudu Anopama Atapattu, Justice for Small Island Nations: Intersections of Equity, Human Rights, and Environmental Justice
Chapter 12:	Clement Yow Mulalap, "To Preserve the Heritage of the Past, and to Protect the Promise of the Future": Intergenerational Equity Challenges From Climate Change in the Federated States of Micronesia
Chapter 13:	Carly Elizabeth Souther & Teresa Giménez-Candela, Climate Justice for Human and Nonhuman Islanders: Domestic Duties, Regional Responsibilities, and International Interventions
UNIT IV:	African and Middle Eastern Perspectives
Chapter 14:	Robert Kibugi, Land Use and Climate Change: Using Planning Tools to Enhance Climate Adaptation in Kenya
Chapter 15:	Onita Das, Climate Change and Armed Conflict: Challenges and Opportunities for Maintaining International Peace and Security Through Climate Justice

Table of Contents vii

Unit V:	SOUTH ASIAN PERSPECTIVES
Chapter 16:	Naysa Ahuja, Taking Climate Justice to the Himalayan Heights: A Proposed Adaptive Mountain Governance Framework to Address Climate Change Impacts in the Indian Himalayan Region
Chapter 17:	Nadia B. Ahmad & Mushtaq ur Rasool Bilal,  Monsoons, Hydropower, and Climate Justice in  Pakistan's River Communities
Chapter 18:	Kamrul Hossain & Noor Jahan Punan, Climate Change Impacts and Human Rights of Rural Women in Bangladesh
UNIT VI:	CLIMATE JUSTICE IN THE COURTS
Chapter 19:	Chilenye Nwapi, From Responsibility to Cost- effectiveness to Litigation: The Evolution of Climate Change Regulation and the Emergence of Climate Justice Litigation
Chapter 20:	Randall S. Abate, Atmospheric Trust Litigation in the United States: Pipe Dream or Pipeline to Justice for Future Generations?
Chapter 21:	Jennifer Huang & Maria Antonia Tigre, Trends in Climate Justice Litigation: The Dutch Case and Global Repercussions
Chapter 22:	Keely Boom, Climate Justice for Future Generations: A Case Study in the Great Barrier Reef World Heritage Site of Australia597
Chapter 23:	Verónica de la Rosa Jaimes, Climate Justice Litigation in the Inter-American Human Rights System to Protect Indigenous Peoples in Mexico
Chapter 24:	Karine Péloffy, Indigenous Peoples Bringing Climate  [Ustice to Canada

# Editor and Contributor Biographies

#### **Editor**

Randall S. Abate is the associate dean for academic affairs and a professor of law at Florida Agricultural and Mechanical University College of Law in Orlando, Florida. Professor Abate teaches climate change law and justice, international environmental law, climate change and indigenous peoples, climate change impacts on ocean and coastal law, constitutional law I and II, and animal law. Professor Abate joined the Florida A&M College of Law faculty in 2009 with 15 years of full-time law teaching experience at Vermont Law School, Widener Law School-Harrisburg, Rutgers School of Law-Camden, Florida Coastal School of Law, and Florida State College of Law. He has taught international and comparative environmental law courses in Argentina, Canada, the Cayman Islands, China, India, Kenya, Kyrgyzstan, Spain, Ukraine, and the United Kingdom. Professor Abate was awarded a Sustainability Institute faculty fellowship from Florida A&M University for the 2016/2017 academic year.

Professor Abate has published and presented widely on environmental law topics, with a recent emphasis on climate change law and justice. His articles on climate change law and justice have appeared in the Stanford Environmental Law Journal, Cornell Journal of Law and Public Policy, Connecticut Law Review, Duke Environmental Law and Policy Forum, Washington Law Review, William and Mary Environmental Law and Policy Review, Tulane Journal of International and Comparative Law, Seattle Journal of Environmental Law, Ottawa Law Review, Tulane Environmental Law Journal, Fordham Environmental Law Review, and UCLA Journal of International Law and Foreign Affairs. He is the editor of What Can Animal Law Learn From Environmental Law? (ELI Press 2015) and Climate Change Impacts ON OCEAN AND COASTAL LAW: U.S. AND INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVES (Oxford University Press 2015) and co-editor of CLIMATE CHANGE AND Indigenous Peoples: The Search for Legal Remedies (Edward Elgar 2013). Early in his career, Professor Abate handled environmental law matters at two law firms in Manhattan. He holds a B.A. from the University of x Climate Justice

Rochester and a J.D. and M.S.E.L. (environmental law and policy) from Vermont Law School.

#### **Contributing Authors**

Nadia B. Ahmad is an assistant professor of law at Barry University Dwayne O. Andreas School of Law. Previously, she was the visiting assistant professor of environmental law at Pace Law School. Professor Ahmad's research explores the intersections of energy law and the environment and draws on international investment law, energy justice, corporate best practices, and corporate social responsibility. Alongside her scholarship on energy law and the environment, Professor Ahmad also writes about women's legal rights in South Asia and the Middle East. Prior to joining Pace Law School, Professor Ahmad worked for a multinational oil and gas company. Additionally, as a legal fellow with the Colorado-based nongovernmental organization Sustainable Development Strategies Group, Professor Ahmad analyzed foreign mining and natural resource development laws for compliance with sustainable development principles. Previously, Professor Ahmad was an attorney in private practice in Florida and handled civil litigation, real property, land use and zoning, corporate, and employment law matters. Professor Ahmad earned a B.A. in comparative literature with language emphases in Latin and English from the University of California at Berkeley with high honors, a J.D. from the University of Florida Levin College of Law, and an LL.M. in environmental and natural resources law from the University of Denver Sturm College of Law. She is a member of the state bars of Florida and Colorado. She has delivered presentations at Columbia Law School, Harvard Law School, Yale University, University of Georgia School of Law, University of Washington School of Law, Albany Law School, American University in Cairo, Texas A&M School of Law, and George Washington University Law School.

Naysa Ahuja is a senior associate at Enviro Legal Defence Firm, the first environmental law firm in India. She works as a consultant on the interface of natural resource management, forest and landscape governance, community access rights, gender justice, and environmental rule of law in India, the United States, and other Asian countries. She is interested in studying the implications of international climate change discussion on resilience-building actions and financing at the national and village levels. Ms. Ahuja has worked with environmental law firms, UN agencies, and international think

tanks including the World Resources Institute (WRI) and World Wildlife Fund-India. At WRI, she helped develop an Environmental Democracy Index (launched in May 2015), which ranks 70 countries against the tenets of Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration. A strong advocate for participative legal and institutional reforms, Ms. Ahuja has conducted several field investigations and multi-stakeholder consultations to submit policy recommendations on strengthening forest and mountain governance to the Government of India. She holds an LL.M. in environmental law from The George Washington University Law School where she was the Thomas Buergenthal scholar of 2013. She is also a recipient of an NFP fellowship at the Centre for Development Innovation, Wageningen University, to study landscape approach in Indonesia (2015). She received her LL.B. from the University of Delhi and practices in the Supreme Court of India and the National Green Tribunal. She has delivered guest lectures, presentations, and conducted training at universities, government agencies, and the United Nations on several occasions. Ms. Ahuja is currently a visiting scholar at Environmental Law Institute in Washington, D.C., while developing her Ph.D. research questions around existing environmental dispute resolution mechanisms to address transboundary resource conflicts.

Dr. Sumudu Anopama Atapattu is the director of research centers and senior lecturer at the University of Wisconsin Law School. She teaches seminar classes on international environmental law and climate change, human rights, and the environment. She is affiliated with UW-Madison's Nelson Institute for Environmental Studies and the Center for South Asia and coordinates the campus-wide interdisciplinary Human Rights Program. She was a visiting professor at Doshisha University Law School, Japan, in summer 2014. Dr. Atapattu serves as the lead counsel for human rights at the Center for International Sustainable Development Law based in Montreal, Canada, and is on the advisory board of the McGill International Journal of Sustainable Development Law and Policy. She has participated in several consultations organized by the United Nations Independent Expert on Human Rights and the Environment, including a consultation on climate change and human rights with the United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. Dr. Atapattu has published widely in the fields of international environmental law, climate change, environmental rights, and sustainable development, and is the author of Human Rights Approaches TO CLIMATE CHANGE: CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES (Routledge 2016). She holds an LL.M. (public international law) and a Ph.D. (internaxii Climate Justice

tional environmental law) from the University of Cambridge, U.K., and is an attorney-at-law of the Supreme Court of Sri Lanka.

Ara Azad is managing partner at AzP Consulting, LLC, a regulatory consulting firm with a primary focus on the energy and utilities industry. Ms. Azad is a certified public accountant with a B.S. in molecular biosciences from the University of Kansas and an M.S. in accounting from the University of Missouri-Kansas City. Prior to her career in regulated utilities consulting, she worked at the international accounting firm PricewaterhouseCoopers as a financial statement auditor. During her career as a consultant, she has provided finance and accounting consulting services to regulators in their public interest reviews of utility mergers and acquisitions, property valuations, and operational and compliance audits. Ms. Azad has served as an expert in the statutory reviews of some of the largest proposed electric and natural gas utility mergers in the United States, having served as an expert witness addressing ratepayer protection issues including accounting and tax matters, merger costs, energy efficiency, impact on employment, community support, and cost allocation.

**Ava Azad** is an attorney-advisor in the Federal Facilities Enforcement Office of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency headquarters in Washington, D.C. She holds a J.D. with an environmental and natural resources law certificate from the University of Kansas, where she received the Hershberger, Patterson, Jones & Roth Energy Law Award. She earned a B.A. in environmental studies and a B.A. in Spanish from the University of Kansas, where she graduated with honors. Ms. Azad has worked at the Conservation Law Foundation (CLF) in Boston in the Clean Energy and Climate Change Program and the Healthy Communities and Environmental Justice Program. At CLF, her projects included analysis and advocacy of clean transportation and environmental justice in the energy, transportation, and food industries in New England. Ms. Azad has also worked in the environmental division of Shook, Hardy & Bacon LLP and the Kansas Department of Health & Environment. She has published on international environmental justice implications of foreign oil exploration in the Florida A&M University Law Review, and has also been published in the Kansas Law Review.

**Josephine M. Balzac** is a visiting assistant professor at Rollins College in the Department of Business. She is also an adjunct law professor at Barry University School of Law teaching sustainability in business. She is admit-

ted to practice in Florida and the U.S. District Court, Middle District of Florida. She serves her community on the board of directors for IDEAS For Us and the EarthWeb Foundation. Professor Balzac previously worked as an associate attorney at an AV-rated trial litigation firm and also worked for a food safety regulatory consulting group. She holds a J.D. from Florida A&M University College of Law where she graduated as valedictorian of her class. While at Florida A&M, Ms. Balzac received several scholarships, including the prestigious Holland & Knight Scholarship. She also won the Third Best Oralist Award during the Stetson International Environmental Moot Court Competition, where her team reached the semifinals. She received her LL.M. in international environmental law at the George Washington University Law School. While attending GWU Law, she served as a Randolph C. Shaw research fellow for the associate dean of environmental studies and interned at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency in the Office of Resource Conservation and Recovery in the International Transportation Branch. Ms. Balzac is actively involved in the environmental community, frequently educating and promoting awareness by being an avid speaker on environmental, food, conservation, and social justice issues. Professor Balzac has also published articles on sustainable development, international trade, human rights, and environmental justice in the Florida A&M University Law Review and the Loyola University of Chicago International Law Review.

Mushtaq ur Rasool Bilal is a Ph.D. candidate in postcolonial feminism at the National University of Modern Languages in Islamabad, Pakistan. His book-length collection of long-form interviews with Pakistani English fiction writers will be published in 2016 by HarperCollins India. He is also working as an editor-at-large at Kitaab, which is both a literary magazine and a publishing house based in Singapore. His work has appeared in academic journals—South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies, Postcolonial Text, Contemporary South Asia, the Annual of Urdu Studies—as well as in popular publications including The News on Sunday, Dawn-Books and Authors, The Missing Slate, and Himal Southasian.

**Dr. Keely Boom** is an Australian Aboriginal woman who is executive officer of the Climate Justice Programme, a nonprofit organization that encourages, supports, and tracks the enforcement of law and legal initiatives to combat climate change. She holds a Ph.D. from the University of Wollongong in international climate change law. Dr. Boom is a research associate at the University of Technology, Sydney and a Research Fellow at the University

xiv Climate Justice

of Wollongong. She is author of the chapter *The Rising Tide of International Climate Litigation: An Illustrative Hypothetical of Tuvalu v. Australia, in CLIMATE CHANGE AND INDIGENOUS PEOPLES: THE SEARCH FOR LEGAL REMEDIES (Randall S. Abate & Elizabeth Ann Kronk Warner eds., 2013). She lives in a rural area and holds a practicing certificate in the state of New South Wales. Dr. Boom is a mother and is passionate about protecting the climate for future generations.* 

**Dr. Wil Burns** is the founding co-director of the Forum for Climate Engineering Assessment, a scholarly initiative of American University. He is based in its western office in Berkeley, California. Dr. Burns previously served as the director of the Master of Science, Energy Policy & Climate Program at Johns Hopkins University in Washington, D.C. He also serves as the co-chair of the International Environmental Law Committee of the American Branch of the International Law Association. Dr. Burns is the former president of the Association for Environmental Studies & Sciences and former co-chair of the International Environmental Law Interest Group of the American Society of International Law and chair of the International Wildlife Law Interest Group of the Society. He has published more than 75 articles in law, science, and policy journals and has co-edited four books. Prior to becoming an academic, he served as assistant secretary of state for public affairs for the state of Wisconsin and worked in the nongovernmental sector for 20 years, including as executive director of the Pacific Center for International Studies, a thinktank that focused on implementation of international wildlife treaty regimes, including the Convention on Biological Diversity and International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling. His current areas of research focus are climate geoengineering; international climate change litigation; and adaptation strategies to address climate change, with a focus on the potential role of microinsurance. Dr. Burns holds a Ph.D. in international environmental law from the University of Wales-Cardiff School of Law.

**Dr. Onita Das** is a senior lecturer in law at the University of the West of England, Bristol. She received her LL.M. in international law at the University of Bristol and Ph.D. in international law at the University of the West of England. Dr. Das currently teaches environmental law at the undergraduate level and contributes to teaching on the international environmental law, natural resources law, and European environmental law and policy modules at the postgraduate level. Her principal research areas are sustainable development, environmental protection relevant to security and armed conflict,

and land grabbing in the context of sustainable development and human rights. She is a core member of the Global Network on Human Rights and the Environment, and in 2015 was a visiting fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law in Cambridge. Dr. Das also serves as the head of the Environmental Law Research Unit at the University of the West of England.

**Dr. Verónica de la Rosa Jaimes** is a research fellow at the Latin American Research Centre and the Canadian Institute of Resources Law at the University of Calgary. She previously served as an Eyes High postdoctoral scholar in the Canadian Institute of Resources Law of the University of Calgary Faculty of Law, where she researched issues in energy development and climate change litigation. Dr. de la Rosa Jaimes holds a J.D., a master's in international law, and a Ph.D. (Hon.) from the National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM). She spent one year conducting research for her doctoral thesis at the University of Montpellier, in France, where she was a visiting professor. She has been a lecturer at the University of Calgary, UNAM, and TEC de Monterrey. Dr. de la Rosa Jaimes is a certified attorney in Mexico where she worked for several government agencies in managing regulatory and legal projects. She has published several books and articles in law journals in Mexico and the United States in the areas of international law, human rights law, and environmental law.

**Dr. Patrícia G. Ferreira** is a postdoctoral fellow with CIGI's International Law Research Program. Dr. Ferreira's research at CIGI focuses on how the intersection of international law institutions with domestic legal institutions may facilitate sustainable development outcomes, with an emphasis on international environmental law. Current research projects include a study on how emerging economies like China, India, Brazil, and South Africa have been shifting their positions in relation to key international law principles, norms, and institutions that may impact sustainable development outcomes. She holds an S.J.D. in law and development from the University of Toronto, which she earned concurrently with an interdisciplinary doctorate in the dynamics of global change from the Munk School of Global Affairs. She has an LL.B. from the Federal University of Bahia and an LL.M. from the University of Notre Dame. A Brazilian national, Dr. Ferreira is a research associate at the Institute for Studies on Labor and Society in Rio de Janeiro. In 2013, she was a visiting scholar and Joaquim Nabuco Chair in Brazilian studies at the Center for Latin American Studies at Stanford University and a visiting scholar at the Fundação Getúlio Vargas Law School in Sao

xvi Climate Justice

Paulo. Before earning her doctoral degree, she worked for nearly 20 years in the fields of human rights and international development. Her professional experience ranges from litigating major Brazilian human rights cases before international bodies as a lawyer for the Center for Justice and International Law to grant making with the Open Society Initiative in Southern Africa.

**Steven Ferrey** is a professor of law at Suffolk University Law School in Boston, and has served as visiting professor of law at Harvard Law School and Boston University Law School. He has testified as an expert witness before seven committees of the U.S. Congress on energy, and was appointed by the president of the United States to serve on three national energy boards. Since 1993, he has served as primary legal advisor to the World Bank and the United Nations on renewable energy and climate change projects in several developing countries in Asia, Africa, and elsewhere. He has served as vicechair of two different American Bar Association Energy Committees. Professor Ferrey is the author of 7 books and 100 articles on environmental and energy law and regulatory topics. His books include the three-volume Law OF INDEPENDENT POWER (40th ed. 2016); ENVIRONMENTAL LAW: EXAM-PLES AND EXPLANATIONS (7th ed. 2016); RENEWABLE POWER IN DEVELOP-ING COUNTRIES (2006); and UNLOCKING THE GLOBAL WARMING TOOLBOX (2010). In addition to a J.D. degree from Boalt Hall at the University of California at Berkeley, he holds a B.A. in economics from Pomona College in California, a master's degree in urban and regional environmental/energy planning from U.C. Berkeley, and was a Fulbright fellow in London between his graduate degrees.

**Dr. Teresa Giménez-Candela** is a professor of law; director and founder of the postgraduate Animals, Law, and Society Program; and director of the master's in animal law and society at the Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona in Spain. She has the distinction of being the first law professor in Spain to teach a course on animal law. Dr. Giménez-Candela is the director of the research group Animales, Derecho y Sociedad, which was awarded official recognition by the autonomous government of Catalonia. She is the founder and editor of the web page www.derechoanimal.info, the first database on animal policy and case law in Spain. She is the founder and director of the collection *Animals and the Law*, printed by the Tirant to Blanch publishing house in Valencia. She is also the founder of the European Group of Animal Law Studies. Dr. Giménez-Candela has more than 25 years of law teaching experience at universities on four continents, including Universidad de

Navarra; Universidad de Valencia; Universitat de les Illes Balears; University of Köln; Fukuoka; UNAM of Mexico; Mayor de S. Simón; Università di Tor Vergata; Università Federico II di Napoli; and New York University. She has received multiple fellowships from the Alexander-von-Humboldt-Stiftung, which enabled her to conduct research at the German universities of München and Heidelberg, in addition to the University of Rome La Sapienza, in the manuscript section of the Vatican Library, and the Maruccelliana Library. She has worked in the *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae* in München, and in the Department of Papyrology of the Ashmolean Museum in Oxford. Dr. Giménez-Candela was trained in Roman law and Latin legal epigraphy and holds an LL.B. and Ph.D. in law with special prize for merit from the Universidad de Navarra in Pamplona.

**Dr. Kamrul Hossain** is an associate professor and director of the Northern Institute for Environmental and Minority Law at the Arctic Centre in the University of Lapland. He has previously served the Faculty of Law of the University of Lapland as acting professor of public international law. He is also an adjunct professor of international law at the University of Lapland. Dr. Hossain leads the research project, HuSArctic, funded by the Academy of Finland. He has been actively involved in a number of significant research projects funded by the European Union, Nordic Council of Ministers, and the Academy of Finland. Dr. Hossain has published scholarly articles in many highly regarded international journals. He served as the special editor for Volume 3 of the Yearbook of Polar Law, published in 2011. He regularly teaches at the University of Lapland, and periodically at other foreign universities. He completed visiting fellowships at a number of foreign universities including the University of Toronto, Scott Polar Research Institute of the University of Cambridge, and the Muroran Institute of Technology in Japan. He has received a number of prestigious awards including the SYLFF fellowship at the University of Helsinki. In 2012, Dr. Hossain was awarded a faculty research fellowship by the Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade.

Jennifer Huang is an international fellow at the Center for Climate and Energy Solutions (C2ES). Ms. Huang tracks and researches international climate policy, focusing on key issues in the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) negotiations, including transparency, the global stocktake under the Paris Agreement, and adaptation. She also helps facilitate dialogues among international policymakers and

xviii Climate Justice

stakeholders. Prior to joining C2ES, she worked as a law clerk at the White House Council on Environmental Quality and as a legal intern in the Ad Hoc Working Group on the Durban Platform for Enhanced Action Implementation Strategy Unit at the UNFCCC secretariat in Bonn, Germany. Ms. Huang also has a background in international criminal law and international human rights, with a special interest in human rights and climate change. She co-authored the chapter Governance of Climate Change Impacts on the Antarctic Marine Environment, in Climate Change Impacts on Ocean and Coastal Law: U.S. and International Perspectives (Randall S. Abate ed., 2015). She has authored articles on transparency, renewable energy, and the U.S. military, and on Darfur genocide reparations before the International Criminal Court. She is also a member of the New York City Bar Association's International Environmental Law Committee. Ms. Huang holds an LL.M. degree in environmental law with a focus on climate change and a J.D. with certificates in international and environmental law from Pace Law School (now the Elisabeth Haub School of Law at Pace University). She holds an interdisciplinary B.A. in war and military studies from New York University.

**Dr. Cameron Jefferies** is an assistant professor and Borden Ladner Gervais energy law fellow at the Faculty of Law, University of Alberta. He holds a B.Sc. and LL.B. from the University of Alberta and an LL.M. and S.J.D. from the University of Virginia School of Law, where he studied as a Fulbright Scholar. Before entering academia, he practiced at Field LLP in Edmonton, Alberta, and worked as a research associate at the Health Law Institute at the University of Alberta. Dr. Jefferies currently researches and teaches in the areas of international law, environmental law, natural resources law, ocean law, and animal law, and is a member of the Intersections of Sustainability Collaborative Research Network on Water Governance, Climate Change, and the Futures of Communities at the University of Alberta. He is keenly interested in public interest law and advocacy and works to promote local environmental law reform. Most recently, his efforts have focused on a Canadian municipal environmental rights movement. He has published several book chapters and articles in U.S. and Canadian law journals, including the Energy Law Journal and the Journal of Environmental Law and Practice, and is the author of Marine Mammal Conservation and the Law of the Sea (Oxford University Press 2016).

**Dr. Robert Kibugi** is a lecturer in law at the University of Nairobi's Centre for Advanced Studies in Environmental Law and School of Law. He previously taught at the Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, in Canada. He holds an LL.B. and an LL.M. from the School of Law, University of Nairobi, and an LL.D. from the Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa. He is an advocate of the High Court of Kenya. His legal and policy research agenda focuses on public participation in natural resource governance; land use law for sustainable development; climate change, including the role of law and policy in the adaptation and mitigation of climate change; energy law; water resources management and rights; and water and sanitation. Since November 2013, Dr. Kibugi has been legal advisor and consultant to the government of Kenya on drafting climate change legislation and policy for the country. He has published various chapters and articles in peer-reviewed books and journals. His current research addresses enhancing community benefits in land-scale large acquisitions for investments, supported by the International Development Research Centre. Dr. Kibugi is a member of the governing board of the International Union for Conservation of Nature Academy of Environmental Law, elected in 2013 to represent the African continent. He is a member of the Climate Change Adaptation Specialist Group at the Asia Pacific Environmental Law Centre at the National University of Singapore, and chief legal counsel for climate change at the Centre for International Sustainable Development Law in Montreal, Canada.

**Dr. Itzchak Kornfeld** is the Giordano research fellow at the Faculty of Law of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem in Israel. He holds a Sc.B. (geology), M.A. (geochemistry), J.D. (Tulane), LL.M. (Georgetown), and LL.D./Ph.D. (Hebrew University). Dr. Kornfeld's main research interests are international environmental law, particularly how courts and tribunals adjudicate issues related to natural resources and water law. He also researches energy law issues, concentrating on the human right to energy. He has written widely on these subjects. Dr. Kornfeld is currently finishing two books. The first is titled Adjudicating International Water Disputes in North America, and the second is Dam(n)ing Natural Resources: Dams and the Destruction of People and the Environment. He was a co-founder and managing articles editor of the Tulane Environmental Law Journal, and clerked for the Honorable David I. Gertler. Dr. Kornfeld worked as a petroleum geologist for 10 years. Early in his career, Dr. Kornfeld litigated numerous environmental and energy cases, including a landmark Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA) case of first impression, where the

xx Climate Justice

district court held that the city of Philadelphia's sewer systems were not per se exempt from CERCLA's definition of "facilities," subject to liability for contribution costs (*United States v. Union Corp.*, 277 F. Supp. 2d 478 (E.D. Pa. 2003)). His environment and natural resources blog is available at itzchakkornfeld.com.

Clement Yow Mulalap, a native of the island of Yap in the Federated States of Micronesia, is the legal adviser for the Permanent Mission of the Federated States of Micronesia to the United Nations, where he primarily reviews international conventions, tracks international organizations, covers United Nations meetings, and negotiates United Nations resolutions on legal matters on behalf of the Federated States of Micronesia. He is the author of the chapter *Islands in the Stream: Addressing Climate Change From a Small Island Developing State Perspective, in Climate Change And Indigenous Peoples:* The Search for Legal Remedies (Randall S. Abate & Elizabeth Ann Kronk Warner eds., 2013). He holds a B.A. in economics (with minors in political science and English) from the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, a J.D. (with a certificate in Asia-Pacific law) from the William S. Richardson School of Law, and an LL.M. in international legal studies from New York University School of Law.

Dr. Chilenye Nwapi is a research associate at the Canadian Institute of Resources Law, University of Calgary. He is also a senior fellow at the Institute for Oil, Gas, Energy, Environment, and Sustainable Development, Afe Babalola University, Nigeria. Dr. Nwapi's research interests cut across various aspects of extractive resource development, including issues of human and environmental rights abuses, extractive sector transparency, and environmental and social impact assessments. He has published extensively in these and other areas in various peer-reviewed journals and has presented his research in national and international conferences in several countries. Dr. Nwapi holds a Ph.D. in transnational litigation from the University of British Columbia (Canada), an LL.M. in energy and environmental law from the University of Calgary (Canada), and an LL.B. from Imo State University, Nigeria. He has been a visiting fellow at the Uppsala Forum for Democracy, Peace, and Justice at Uppsala Universitet in Sweden. He has taught at the University of British Columbia and the University of Calgary and is an associate editor of the Journal of Sustainable Development Law and Policy. In addition to the prestigious Banting Fellowship, he has been awarded numerous other fellowships and scholarships, including the Social Sciences and

Humanities Research Council Postdoctoral Fellowship, the Law Foundation of British Columbia Fellowship, and the Alberta Law Foundation Scholarship. He is a barrister and solicitor of the Supreme Court of Nigeria.

Dr. Damilola S. Olawuyi is an associate professor of petroleum, energy and environmental law at the HBKU Law School, Qatar, and chancellor's fellow at the Institute for Oil, Gas, Energy and Environment, Nigeria. A prolific and highly regarded scholar, Dr. Olawuyi has published more than 30 peer-reviewed articles, books, and reports on carbon finance, climate justice, extractive resource governance, and the intersections of human rights and the environment. His most recent publication is THE HUMAN RIGHTS-Based Approach to Carbon Finance (Cambridge University Press 2016). Dr. Olawuyi was formerly deputy director and head of international environmental law at the Centre for International Governance Innovation (CIGI), Canada. He also practiced as an international energy lawyer at Norton Rose Fulbright Canada LLP, Calgary, where he served on the firm's global committee on extractive resource investments in Africa. He has lectured on energy and environmental law in more than 20 countries, including Australia, Canada, China, Indonesia, Denmark, France, India, Kenya, Nigeria, Spain, the United Kingdom, and the United States. Dr. Olawuyi holds a doctoral degree in energy and environmental law from the University of Oxford, an LL.M. from Harvard Law School, another LL.M. from the University of Calgary, and a diploma in international environmental law from the United Nations Institute for Training and Research (Switzerland). He earned his LL.B. from Igbinedion University, Nigeria, graduating with first-class honors, and his B.L. from the Nigerian Law School, also graduating with first-class honors. He serves on the executive committees and boards of the American Society of International Law (co-chair, African Interest Group), the International Law Association (London), and the Environmental Law Centre (Alberta). He is vice president of the International Law Association (Nigerian branch), editor-in-chief of the Journal of Sustainable Development Law and Policy, associate fellow of the Centre for International Sustainable Development Law (Montreal), and, most recently, the David Sive scholar at the Sabin Center for Climate Change Law, Columbia Law School.

**Karine Péloffy** has been a lawyer since 2007 and is the executive director of the Quebec Center for Environmental Law (CQDE). As the CQDE director, she has been active on the Center's legal files, such as two successful injunctions to protect species at risk in the past year, including against a proposed

xxii Climate Justice

oil export terminal in a beluga whale nursery in the Saint Lawrence River. Ms. Péloffy formerly practiced commercial litigation at a top-tier Canadian law firm and served as a community rights lawyer for forest communities and civil society organizations in the Congo Basin countries of Africa. In 2013, she published the first comparative law article on climate litigation in Canada and the United States, which analyzed the case of Kivalina v. Exxon-*Mobil* in light of the jurisprudence of the Supreme Courts of both countries. She has presented the results of this article before government commissions and at university conferences. She also has campaigned with the Eradicating Ecocide Global Initiative in London and has lived, traveled, and volunteered with several initiatives dedicated to social and environmental justice in America, Africa, Europe, and Australasia. Ms. Péloffy was awarded the Lawyer of the Year/Tomorrow's Leader in the alternative career category by the Montreal Young Bar Association. She holds an M.Sc. in environmental change and management from the University of Oxford and a B.C.L./LL.B. from McGill University's unique transsystemic law program.

Noor Jahan Punam is writing her master's thesis at the University of Eastern Finland, where she is majoring in climate change law. She has previously completed a post graduate certificate in management of land acquisition, rehabilitation, and resettlement at Brac University, Bangladesh. In 2011, she completed a post graduate diploma in bar professional training from Northumbria University, U.K., and she was called to the Bar of England and Wales in 2012. Ms. Punam holds an LL.B. degree from the University of London's international program. She has worked at the Bangladesh Institute of Law and International Affairs as a research assistant assisting the editorial process of the *Bangladesh Journal of Law*. She has also worked as an associate lawyer at Giambrone Law in Palermo, Italy. In addition, Ms. Punam worked for the law desk at the *Daily Star, Bangladesh* writing on contemporary legal issues in Bangladesh. Ms. Punam also has delivered lectures at various authorized institutions of the University of London in Bangladesh.

**Keith W. Rizzardi** joined the St. Thomas law faculty in 2011 after many years of government service to the U.S. Department of Justice and the South Florida Water Management District. An accomplished litigator, he appeared in water and wildlife cases before administrative, trial, or appellate courts from the Florida Everglades to the California Central Valley Project, and from Washington, D.C. to Hawaii. As a counselor and policy advisor, he chaired the Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee, assisted local governments

with the challenges of compliance with public records laws, and volunteers as an ombudsman for the U.S. Department of Defense. A Florida Bar leader, he chaired the Government Lawyer Section, served on the state bar's ethics and professionalism committees, and earned recognition as a board certified specialist in state & federal administrative practice. Professor Rizzardi has authored nearly two dozen articles and book chapters, and his teaching and scholarship have focused on administrative law, civil procedure, environmental law, negotiation, professional responsibility, and regulatory compliance. He is a graduate of the University of Virginia (B.A. 1991), University of Florida (J.D. 1994), and Florida Atlantic University (M.P.A. 1998). Professor Rizzardi has shared his education, experience, and writings in dozens of conferences, and he taught internationally at the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization Water Institute in the Netherlands and at the China University of Political Science and Law in Beijing.

**David Roche** is a staff attorney with the Environmental Law Institute, where he specializes in coastal community health and resilience in the Gulf of Mexico, Arctic, and Caribbean. In the past two years, his work has been published in The Environmental Forum, the National Wetlands Newsletter (cover article), the Duke Environmental Law and Policy Forum, and by Oxford University Press and ELI Press. In addition to published work, Mr. Roche writes a blog on ocean issues entitled "Ocean Talk" for ELI, writes many onlineonly articles on ocean and coastal issues, and develops interactive tools to assist coastal communities in engaging with environmental issues. He also has been a featured speaker at a number of conferences, including Restore America's Estuaries and State of Our Coast, and moderates ELI's Ocean Seminar Series. He graduated from Duke University School of Law magna cum laude, where he was editor-in-chief of the Duke Environmental Law and Policy Forum, and also received a master's degree in environmental science from Duke's Nicholas School. His undergraduate degree is in environmental science from Columbia University.

Carly Elizabeth Souther is a researcher for the International Center for Animal Law and Policy and an adjunct professor in the Master's of Animal Law and Society Program at Universitat Autónoma de Barcelona. She co-authored the chapter *Invasive Animal Species: International Impacts and Inadequate Interventions*, in What Can Animal Law Learn From Environmental Law? (Randall S. Abate ed., 2015). She has published on a wide range of issues in both legal and medical journals, including the *Georgetown Journal* 

on Poverty Law & Policy and the Care Management Journal. Ms. Souther formerly served as assistant general counsel at Florida's Agency for Health Care Administration, a research fellow at the Center for Innovative Collaboration in Medicine and the Law of the Florida State University College of Medicine, and second-chair of the Juvenile Justice course at the Florida State University College of Law. Ms. Souther is co-founder, pro bono chair, and past president of Petagon International, Inc., and is a member of the Florida Bar. She holds a master's in animal law and society from the Universitat Autónoma de Barcelona, a J.D. from the Florida State University College of Law, and a B.A. in political science from Mercer University.

Maria Antonia Tigre is an attorney in the environment program at the Cyrus R. Vance Center for International Justice. She works with nongovernmental organizations across the globe on environmental law issues, especially on forests and the interface between climate change and human rights. Ms. Tigre has worked with environmental law firms, infrastructure companies, and international nongovernmental organizations, including the World Resources Institute (WRI). She began her career in Brazil, where she assisted infrastructure companies in environmental impact assessments, environmental permitting procedures, and due diligence requirements. At WRI, she developed a toolkit for urban governance in developing world cities through a comparative analysis of best practices. Ms. Tigre holds a double LL.M., magna cum laude, from Pace Law School (environmental law and comparative legal studies). She received her LL.B. from the Pontificia Universidade Católica of Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. Ms. Tigre was a visiting scholar at Widener Law School and Maurice A. Dean Law School at Hofstra University. Her research focuses on comparative environmental law in Latin America. She is writing a book on cooperation between the countries that share the Amazon rainforest, which analyzes national, regional, and international forest law and the Amazon Cooperation Treaty Organization. She recently published an article, Cooperation for Climate Mitigation in Amazonia: Brazil's Emerging Role as a Regional Leader, in the Fall 2016 issue of the Transnational Environmental Law (TEL) journal published by Cambridge University Press. Ms. Tigre is fluent in Portuguese, English, and German, with basic understanding of French and Spanish.

xxiv Climate Justice

### **Acknowledgments**

This book addresses a daunting global challenge and it demanded a substantial and collaborative global effort in research and writing. The book would not have been possible without the outstanding chapters and indispensable insights and support from the 30 contributing authors from 16 countries in this volume. The chapters contain detailed and thoughtful analysis on cutting-edge issues from both established and rising scholars and practitioners who work in a wide range of settings including academia, private practice, government agencies, and nongovernmental organizations within and outside the legal profession. The editor is grateful to have had the privilege of working with such a remarkable team on this book project.

A small army of volunteer research assistants throughout the United States and abroad provided essential support in the book manuscript assembly and review process. Volunteer research assistants who provided outstanding assistance above and beyond the call of duty were attorney Mackenzie Landa and students Jomayra Belmonte, Chelsea Hernandez-Silk, and April Williams. Several other volunteer research assistants who provided valuable assistance were attorneys Jess Beaulieu, Jacqueline Bertelsen, Christine Castro, Claribel Gonzalez, Jerry Leakey, Vanessa McCarthy, Sabrina Persaud, Divya Pillai, Dan Schreiber, Teodora Siderova, and Karina Valencia, and students Miles Archabal, Oscar Burkholder, Tatiana Devia, Sacha Dixon, Sean Fann, Katheryn Goulfine, Kohinoor Mahi, Justin Pon, Leara Morris-Stokes, Kaleigh Pappas, Michael Scott, Latravia Smith, Kayleen Tinoco, Emily Wajert, Marlon White, and Demetrius Wilson.

This work was supported in part by Florida A&M University's Sustainability Institute. The editor is grateful to his wife, Nigara, for her love and support.

### Introduction

Climate change is one of the most complex political, social, and environmental issues of this century at all levels of governance. Climate change regulation rose to prominence in the 1990s with the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) and Kyoto Protocol mitigation mandates. It soon became clear, however, that an exclusive focus on greenhouse gas mitigation in climate change regulation would be insufficient to address the challenge of global climate change. Although climate change mitigation must continue to proceed as ambitiously as possible, severe climate change impacts have occurred and will continue to occur with increasing intensity.

Consequently, climate change adaptation has become an increasingly large focus of global efforts to address climate change. Although climate change adaptation measures are underway worldwide in many forms and in many sectors of society, the international community's attention regarding climate change adaptation has been on developing countries' needs. Consensus emerged that additional protection is necessary to ensure the health and safety of the most vulnerable communities of the world such as the urban and rural poor, low-lying island nations, indigenous peoples, and future generations in the face of climate change impacts. Early case studies that gained international attention regarding the need for effective adaptation include the Inuit indigenous community in the Arctic, and South Pacific island nations like Tuvalu and Kiribati, whose cultures and physical environments are on the brink of extermination from climate change impacts.

Climate justice evolved in response to this need for equity in the global response to these and other challenges associated with the disparate burdens of these impacts. Climate justice can be defined generally as addressing the disproportionate burden of climate change impacts on poor and marginalized communities and as seeking to promote more equitable allocation of the burdens of these impacts at the local, national, and global levels through proactive regulatory initiatives and reactive judicial remedies that draw on international human rights and domestic environmental justice theories. Efforts to define climate justice as a field of inquiry can be elusive and underinclusive, however, because the concept is so vast in scope.

xxviii Climate Justice

This book provides an overview of the landscape of climate justice from a variety of legal and geographic perspectives in a case study format. It analyzes climate justice from an international law perspective and from the perspectives of legal responses to promote climate justice in several regions of the world, including Pacific island nations, South Asia, North America, and Africa and the Middle East. It addresses proposed solutions to a range of regulatory obstacles under international law, U.S. law, and foreign domestic law in seeking to promote climate justice on a global scale.

The book underscores how climate justice involves multiple legal parameters and regulatory strategies. First, there are procedural and substantive dimensions to promoting climate justice. Procedural dimensions involve efforts to enhance public participation, consultation with affected communities, and access to justice on these issues. Chapter 8 addresses procedural dimensions of climate justice for affected communities in the Gulf of Mexico in the wake of the *Deepwater Horizon* oil spill, whereas Chapter 9 addresses procedural-based climate justice protections for indigenous peoples in Alberta's oils sands region. Substantive dimensions of climate justice involve efforts to assert human rights-based protections as a response to climate change impacts. Chapters 1, 6, and 10 address various dimensions of the potential role of substantive human rights-based protections.

Second, climate justice involves both mitigation and adaption dimensions. Climate justice can be achieved in part through mitigation policies and efforts at the international level. Examples include international climate regulation negotiations pursuant to the common but differentiated responsibility paradigm addressed in Chapter 2, exploring potential climate geoengineering strategies discussed in Chapter 6, and approving an amendment to the Montreal Protocol stratospheric ozone depletion regime to address hydrofluorocarbons as a potent greenhouse gas, as discussed in Chapter 12. To the extent that climate mitigation efforts are successful, climate justice for vulnerable communities is achieved to some degree. But the focus of climate justice is primarily in the adaptation domain. Legal responses such as the loss and damage mechanism in the Paris Agreement and climate justice litigation strategies focus on helping vulnerable communities adapt to the devastating climate impacts that they are experiencing. Adaptation measures range from financial and technological assistance from developed countries to developing countries, as addressed in Chapter 3, to preservation of cultural heritage and potential relocation of displaced communities and nations, as discussed in Chapters 11-13.

Introduction xxix

Third, climate justice also explores the role of climate change impacts as a "threat multiplier," which refers to how climate change impacts can exacerbate an existing context of social and environmental vulnerability. Chapters 14 and 15 address this concept in Kenya and the Middle East. Chapter 14 discusses how climate change impacts such as drought act as a threat multiplier to an already compromised system of agricultural productivity. Chapter 15 discusses how climate change impacts exacerbated an already volatile context for conflict in Syria and South Sudan.

Fourth, the quest for climate justice proceeds in proactive and reactive forms. Both types of responses are necessary. Proactive regulation of climate change adaptation and mitigation have occurred at the international, regional, national, subnational, and local levels of governance. Though wellintentioned, these efforts are incapable of offering complete or even minimally effective responses to promote climate justice. Therefore, much of the focus of recent climate justice has been in response to a dissatisfaction with the adequacy of proactive responses or, in some instances, the failure to implement any form of proactive response. The book contains a unit on climate justice litigation to explore the range of reactive litigation strategies that have been employed, which includes the most famous of these efforts to date—the *Urgenda* case in the Netherlands (Chapter 21). Other climate justice litigation theories explored in the book include atmospheric justice litigation in the United States and abroad (Chapter 20), fossil fuel divestment litigation (Chapter 5), the World Heritage Convention (Chapter 22), and international and regional human rights protections, and domestic law protections, for indigenous peoples (Chapters 10, 23, and 24). These creative and unique litigation strategies share a common theme at their foundation in relying on the principle of intergenerational equity as the basis for their relief.

Within academic circles, climate change law has grown rapidly in the past three decades as a specialty area within environmental law and international law. Dozens of law schools in the United States and abroad offer courses and have developed specialty programs relating to climate change regulation. Climate justice has emerged as a subspecialty in this field and is drawing increased attention. In the international diplomacy context, the prelude to the much-anticipated 21st Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC climate change negotiations in Paris in November 2015, and the unresolved human rights issues in its wake, have propelled climate justice to the fore front as a focus to help define future efforts to ensure a sustainable planet for future generations through effective climate change regulation.