by
Tom Mounteer

ELI Press Environmental Law Institute Washington, D.C.

Copyright © 2009 Environmental Law Institute 2000 L Street NW, Washington, DC 20036

Published June 2009.

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing.

Copyright is not claimed as to any part of the original work prepared by a United States government officer or employee as part of that person's official duties.

Printed in the United States of America ISBN 978-1-5876-148-7

Summary of Contents

	r From ELI's President	
Forev	word	xvii
Abou	t the Authors	xix
Intro	duction	1
1	Science of Climate Change	7
	International Legal Framework	
3	U.S. Federal Law	35
4	Regional Initiatives	77
5	State Initiatives	103
6	Private Sector Voluntary Initiatives	133
7	Impact of Certain Other U.S. Laws	149
	ndices	

Detailed Table of Contents

Letter From ELI's President	xv
Foreword	xvii
About the Authors	xix
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: Science of Climate Change	7
1.1 Emission of Greenhouse Gases and Effects of Atmospheric Warming	7
1.2 Means of Abating and Adapting to Climate Change Impacts	8
1.2.1 Energy Efficiency and Conservation	8
1.2.1.1 Energy Providers	8
1.2.1.1.1 "Clean Coal"	9
1.2.1.1.2 Combined Cycle Natural Gas Facilities	9
1.2.1.2 Consumer Choices	10
1.2.1.2.1 Vehicle Fuel Efficiency	10
1.2.1.2.2 Energy-Efficient Products and Buildings	11
1.2.2 Alternative Energy	11
1.2.2.1 Renewables	11
1.2.2.1.1 Hydropower	11
1.2.2.1.2 Wind	13
1.2.2.1.3 Solar	13
1.2.2.1.4 Geothermal	14
1.2.2.1.5 Biofuel	14
1.2.2.2 Nuclear	15
1.2.3 Carbon Sequestration	16
1.2.3.1 Physical Sequestration (Carbon Capture and Storage)	16
1.2.3.1.1 Carbon Capture	16
1.2.3.1.2 Geological Sequestration	17
1.2.3.2 Biological and Ocean Sequestration	18
1.2.4 Adaptation	18

Chapter 2: International Legal Framework	21
2.1 U.N. Framework Convention on Climate Change	21
2.2 Kyoto Protocol	21
2.2.1 Emissions Trading	22
2.2.2 Joint Implementation and the Clean Development Mechanism	22
2.2.3 Clean Development Mechanism Standard	22
2.2.3.1 Project Design	23
2.2.3.2 Eligibility	24
2.2.3.3 Additionality	24
2.2.3.4 Baseline and Monitoring Methodologies	25
2.2.3.5 Official Development Assistance	25
2.2.3.6 Validation and Registration	26
2.2.3.7 Monitoring, Verification, Certification, and Issuance	26
2.2.3.8 Accrediting and Evaluating Auditors	27
2.2.3.9 Registries	27
2.3 Regulatory Regimes to Implement Kyoto Protocol	27
2.3.1 European Union Emissions Trading Scheme	
2.3.1.1 Basic Framework	27
2.3.1.2 Lessons From Phase I	29
2.3.1.3 Post-2012	
2.3.2 Other Nations Developing Carbon Trading Programs	30
2.3.2.1 Canada	30
2.3.2.2 Japan	31
2.3.2.3 Australia	32
2.4 Post-Kyoto: The Future of International Climate Change Agreements.	33
Chapter 3: U.S. Federal Law	
3.1 GHG Litigation	35
3.1.1 Clean Air Act	
3.1.1.1 Mobile Sources	35
3.1.1.1.1 Massachusetts v. EPA	35
3.1.1.1.2 Motor Vehicle Waiver Petition and Litigation	38
3.1.1.2 Stationary Sources	41
3.1.2 Common Law Bases	
3.1.2.1 Public Plaintiffs	44
3.1.2.2 Private Plaintiffs	45
3.2 Early Administrative Initiatives	46
3.2.1 Final Rules	
3.2.1.1 Department of Energy Programs	47

3.2.1.1.1 Voluntary Reporting of GHG Program—the 1605(b)	
Program	47
3.2.1.1.2 Climate VISION (Voluntary Innovative Sector Initiatives:	
Opportunities Now)	47
3.2.1.1.3 U.S. Climate Change Technology Program	48
3.2.1.2 U.S. Department of Agriculture: Methane-to-Markets Program	48
3.2.1.3 Environmental Protection Agency Near-Term GHG Reduction	
Initiatives	48
3.2.1.3.1 Difficulties Encountered by EPA Voluntary Reporting	
Programs	
3.2.1.3.2 Clean Energy-Environment State Partnership	49
3.2.1.3.3 Climate Leaders GHG Inventory Guidance Program	49
3.2.1.3.4 Combined Heat and Power Partnership	49
3.2.1.3.5 Energy Star	50
3.2.2 Proposed Rules	51
3.2.2.1 EPA Safe Drinking Water Act Carbon Sequestration Rulemaking	51
3.2.2.2 EPA Advanced Notice on Regulating GHGs and Interpretation	
of the Applicability of the PSD Program to CO ₂	52
3.2.2.3 Mandatory Emissions Reporting	
3.2.2.3.1 Congressional Directive	55
3.2.2.3.2 EPA's Proposed Rule for the Mandatory Reporting of GHGs	56
3.3 Comprehensive GHG Legislation	
3.3.1 The Politics of Climate Change	59
3.3.2 Cap-and-Trade Bills	
3.3.2.1 Sectors and Pollutants Covered.	
3.3.2.2 CO ₂ Reductions	
3.3.2.3 Distribution of Emissions Allowances	
3.3.2.4 GHG Emissions Trading Market	
3.3.2.5 Use of Auction Revenue	
3.3.2.6 "Safety Valves" and "Offsets"	
3.3.2.7 Reconciliation With Existing Programs	
3.3.3 Investment Tax Credits	
3.3.4 Carbon Tax	
3.4 Energy Tax Policy	
3.4.1 Energy Tax Policy Generally	
3.4.2 Traditional and Non-Renewable Energy Sources	
3.4.2.1 Taxes	
3.4.2.2 Tax Credits	
3.4.2.3 Deductions	
3.4.2.4 Depreciation and Amortization	67

3.4.2.5 Deferred Gain	68
3.4.2.6 Special Capital Gains Treatment	68
3.4.3 Nuclear	68
3.4.4 Alternative Fuels/Renewable Energy and Conservation	68
3.4.4.1 Renewable Energy and Forest Conservation Tax Credits	68
3.4.4.2 Renewable Energy and Forest Conservation Bond Credits	69
3.4.4.3 Deductions	70
3.4.4.4 Alternative Fuels and Alternative Fuel Vehicles	70
3.4.4.5 Conservation and Energy Efficiency	71
3.5 Corporate Average Fuel Economy Standards	72
3.5.1 In General	72
3.5.2 Regulating Fuel Efficiency Through Federal Standards	73
3.5.3 Current and Proposed Standards	75
Chapter 4: Regional Initiatives	
4.1 Overview of Procedures	
4.1.1 Pacts Among Member States	
4.1.2 Regulatory Flexibility for State-by-State Implementation	
4.1.3 Structural Patterns—Market Initiatives	
4.1.3.1 Tradable Emission Allowances	
4.1.3.2 Offsets/Safety Valves	
4.1.3.3 Monitoring	
4.1.3.4 Allocation to Applicable Sectors	
4.2 The Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative	
4.2.1 The RGGI Memorandum of Understanding and Model Rule	
4.2.2 Carbon Budgets	
4.2.3 Allowance Distribution	
4.2.3.1 Auctions	
4.2.3.2 Holders of Allowances	
4.2.3.3 Regional Auction Rules	
4.2.4 Flexibility and Market Relief	
4.2.4.1 Offsets	
4.2.4.2 Safety Valves	
4.2.5 Monitoring	
4.3 The Western Climate Initiative	
4.3.1 Governors' Agreement and Statement of Regional Goal	90
4.3.2 The WCI Work Plan and Design Recommendations for State	
Implementation	
4.3.2.1 Regional Administration and Reporting	
4.3.2.1.1 Application	92

4.3.2.1.2 Verification	93
4.3.2.1.3 Coordination	93
4.3.2.2 Scope and Affected Entities	93
4.3.2.2.1 Electricity Generation	94
4.3.2.2.2 Transportation and Small Stationary-Source Fuels	95
4.3.2.3 Emissions Capping, Apportionment, and Allocation	95
4.3.2.3.1 Setting the Regional Cap	95
4.3.2.3.2 WCI Member State Apportionment	96
4.3.2.3.3 Allocations to Regulated Entities	96
4.3.2.4 Offsetting and Safety Valves	97
4.3.2.4.1 Project Certification	97
4.3.2.4.2 Use Limitations	97
4.4 The Midwestern Regional Greenhouse Gas Accord	98
4.4.1 Developing a Cap/Trade Program	99
4.4.2 Additional Proposed Mechanisms	100
Chapter 5: State Initiatives	103
5.1 State Renewable Portfolio Standards	
5.1.1 Generally and State Examples	
5.1.1.1 New York Renewable Portfolio Standard	
5.1.1.2 Oregon Graduated Renewable Portfolio Standard	
5.1.2 Renewable Energy Credits	
5.1.2.1 Defined	
5.1.2.2 Attributes Included With RECs	107
5.1.3 Certificate Tracking Systems	109
5.1.3.1 Mechanism for Establishing RPS Compliance	109
5.1.3.2 Regional Tracking Systems	
5.1.3.2.1 PJM Generation Attribute Tracking System	
5.1.3.2.2 New England Power Pool Generation Info System	110
5.1.3.2.3 Western Renewable Energy GIS	110
5.1.3.2.4 Midwest Renewable Energy Tracking System	111
5.1.3.3 State Tracking Systems	111
5.1.3.3.1 New York—A Manual Tracking System	111
5.1.3.3.2 New York's Environmental Disclosure Labels	113
5.1.3.3.3 Texas—ERCOT	114
5.1.3.4 North American Renewables Registry	115
5.1.4 Key Elements of Tracking Systems	115
5.1.4.1 Attributes Included	115
5.1.4.2 Registration of RECs	116
5.1.4.3 Transfers	116

5.2 Other State Approaches1	17
5.2.1 California Global Warming Solutions Act (AB 32)1	17
5.2.1.1 Background	17
5.2.1.2 Mandatory Reporting and Verification of Statewide GHG	
Emissions1	17
5.2.1.3 Determining 1990-Level GHG Emissions as Baseline	18
5.2.1.4 Discrete "Early Action" Items	18
5.2.1.5 Scoping Plan1	19
5.2.1.5.1 Cap-and-Trade1	19
5.2.1.5.2 Energy Efficiency Standards and RPS1	20
5.2.1.5.3 Fuel Efficiency Standards for Vehicles	20
5.2.1.5.4 Auditing Energy Efficiency	20
5.2.1.5.5 Unresolved Issues	20
5.2.2 Massachusetts1	21
5.2.2.1 Massachusetts' Global Warming Solutions Act	21
5.2.2.2 Carbon Emission Standards for Base-Load Generation	21
5.2.2.3 Massachusetts Green Communities Act	22
5.2.2.4 Renewable Fuel Standard and Tax Benefit	23
5.2.3 New York	24
5.2.3.1 Green Building Tax Credits1	24
5.2.3.2 Energy Efficiency Portfolio Standards	25
5.2.4 Oregon	25
5.2.4.1 Carbon Emissions Standards for New Energy Facilities	25
5.2.4.2 Renewable Fuel Standards	27
5.2.5 Washington1	27
5.2.5.1 SB 28151	27
5.2.5.1.1 State Emission Limitations1	27
5.2.5.1.2 Anticipating the WCI1	29
5.2.5.1.3 GHG Emissions Reporting1	30
5.2.5.1.4 Transportation Miles Reductions	30
5.2.5.2 Carbon Mitigation for Fossil-Fuel-Fired Power Plants	31
5.2.5.3 GHG Emission Standards for Utility Financial Commitments1	32
Chapter 6: Private Sector Voluntary Initiatives	33
6.1 Voluntary Carbon Markets	
6.1.1 The Market for "Carbon Offsets" Generally	
6.1.2 Threshold Concerns	
6.1.2.1 Project Design Standards and Offset "Screens"	
6.1.2.1.1 Generally	
6.1.2.1.2 PDS Examples	
0.1.2.1.2 1 DO DAIMPIO	ט ט

6.1.2.2 Offset Accounting Protocols	135
6.1.2.2.1 ISO 14,064	135
6.1.2.2.2 GHG Protocol for Project Accounting	136
6.1.3 Principal Voluntary Carbon Offset Standards	
6.1.3.1 The Gold Standard	
6.1.3.2 Voluntary Carbon Standard	137
6.1.3.3 VER+	137
6.1.3.4 Chicago Climate Exchange	138
6.1.4 Evaluation of Key Elements of Voluntary Standards	138
6.1.4.1 Project Design	138
6.1.4.2 Public Participation	138
6.1.4.3 Project Eligibility	139
6.1.4.4 Additionality	140
6.1.4.5 Methods for Determining "Business as Usual" Baselines	141
6.1.4.6 Validation and Registration	141
6.1.4.7 Monitoring, Verification, Certification, and Issuance	142
6.1.4.8 Auditor Credentials	142
6.1.4.9 Registries	143
6.2 Voluntary REC Market	143
6.2.1 Generally	143
6.2.2 Interplay Between Voluntary and Compliance REC Markets	
6.2.3 Interplay Between RECs and Carbon Offsets	
6.3 Wall Street Banks' "Carbon Principles"	146
6.3.1 Participants	146
6.3.2 Purpose	146
6.3.3 Mechanisms	146
6.3.3.1 Three Carbon Principles	
6.3.3.2 Enhanced Environmental Due Diligence Process	147
Chapter 7: Impact of Certain Other U.S. Laws	
7.1 Climate Change and Environmental Impact Statements	
7.1.1 Federal Litigation	
7.1.1.1 Los Angeles v. NHTSA	
7.1.1.2 Decisions Subsequent to Los Angeles v. NHSTA	
7.1.2 Other Federal Activities	
7.1.3 State and Local Environmental Impact Assessment Requirements	
7.1.4 California Environmental Quality Act	
7.1.4.1 Overview of CEQA	155
7.1.4.1.1 Environmental Impact Reports and Negative or Mitigated	
Negative Declarations	156

7.1.4.1.2 Significant and Cumulatively Considerable Impacts	156
7.1.4.1.3 Duty to Avoid and Mitigate Environmental Damage	157
7.1.4.2 CEQA Developments Concerning Climate Change	157
7.1.4.2.1 Calculating GHG Emissions	157
7.1.4.2.2 Determining Whether GHG Emissions Are Significant	158
7.1.4.2.3 Mitigation	160
7.1.5 Other States	161
7.1.5.1 Litigation	161
7.1.5.2 Development of Policies	161
7.2 Climate Change and the Endangered Species Act	162
7.2.1 ESA Generally	163
7.2.2 Polar Bear Listing	163
7.2.2.1 The Listing Decision	163
7.2.2.2 Regulatory Actions	165
7.2.2.3 Legal Challenges	166
7.2.3 Other Federal Case Law	166
7.3 Federal Trade Commission Jurisdiction Over Green Marketing Claims	.168
7.3.1 Consumer Protection Authority Generally and Its Exercise in the	
Environmental Arena	168
7.3.1.1 Authority to Prevent Deceptive Marketing Claims	
7.3.1.2 The Green Guides Generally	
7.3.2 Green Guides Revisions for Green Energy	
7.3.2.1 Carbon Offsets and RECs	170
7.3.2.2 Consumer Understanding, Additionality, and Double Counting	
7.3.2.3 Third-Party Certification	
7.3.3 Green Packaging, Building, and Textile Claims	
7.3.4 Prospects	
7.4 Securities Disclosure	173
7.4.1 Regulation Securities Disclosure Requirements	
7.4.1.1 Item 101: Disclosure of Capital Expenditures	173
7.4.1.2 Item 103: Disclosure of Legal Proceedings	
7.4.1.3 Item 303: Management Discussion and Analysis	174
7.4.2 Disclosure of Other Environmental Liabilities and Calls for More	
Robust Disclosure of Climate Change Impacts	
7.4.3 Regulated Community Practice	
7.5 Other Overlap Between Climate Change and Federal Laws	
7.5.1 Water Law	
7.5.2 National Security Law	178

Appendices

A	Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, Model Rule (Dec. 31, 2008)	.181
В	Western Climate Initiative, Design Recommendations for the WCI	
	Regional Cap-and-Trade Program (Sept. 23, 2008)	.319
С	Midwestern Governor's Association, Midwestern Greenhouse Gas Accord	
	(Nov. 15, 2007)	.391
D	State Renewable Portfolio Standards by Region	.397
E	State Law Definitions of Renewable Energy Credits	.413
F	List of Climate Change Website Resource Links	.421

ELI's Climate Change Deskbook

Climate change is a defining issue of the next generation of environmental law. While our first generation of environmental statutes largely focused on media-specific approaches to addressing environmental issues, climate change calls us to reevaluate our energy system, the way we do business, the dynamics of consumption, and the fundamental relationship between economy and ecology.

The Climate Change Deskbook is part of ELI's comprehensive program to address climate change and energy challenges. We believe any approach to climate change must be strategic, comprehensive, and creative, as no single solution, from federal capand-trade legislation to international treaty, will be sufficient to meet these challenges. As described on ELI's website at www.eli.org, ELI's climate program coordinates climate and energy governance, works to ensure effective implementation of energy and climate laws and policies, and harnesses the creative intellectual capacity of environmental professionals to combat global warming. This deskbook is an example of the program at work, as we seek to make climate law more accessible to practitioners.

The Climate Change Deskbook is part of Environmental Law Institute's Deskbook series, which combines the invaluable experience of the top practitioners in the field with the encyclopedic coverage and keen insight provided by the staff of the Environmental Law Reporter. Deskbooks provide practicing attorneys, students, environmental professionals, and government officials an "at-the-fingertips" resource for accessing and understanding environmental law. The series covers endangered species, wetlands, NEPA, TSCA, FIFRA, and many other topics by combining in-depth analysis of the topic with necessary reference materials, such as regulations, guidance documents, and forms.

The Deskbooks are natural partners to ELI's flagship resource, the *Environmental Law Reporter*. *ELR* is an attorney-edited gateway to researching and understanding environmental law and policy, with coverage since 1971 available on-line in an easily searchable format. *ELR* couples thousands of insightful articles on environmental law and policy with the most important updates, decisions, statutes, regulations, and agency documents and a cumulative index and bibliography to help you navigate this highly complex area of law. More information about both the Deskbooks and *ELR* is available at www.eli.org.

The *Climate Change Deskbook* was authored by Tom Mounteer and his very able colleagues at Paul Hastings by building on their many years of distinguished practice in environmental law. We are very grateful to them for their hard work and dedication in bringing the Deskbook into being. *ELR* staff also deserve our sincerest thanks for their effort and skill in helping us to create this valuable resource.

The Environmental Law Institute makes law work for people, places, and the planet. With its non-partisan, independent approach, ELI promotes solutions to tough environmental problems. The Institute's unparalleled research and highly respected publications inform the public debate and build the institutions needed to advance sustainable development. We hope the *Climate Change Deskbook* provides valuable insight into this fascinating and complex new area of environmental law and regulation.

Leslie Carothers President Environmental Law Institute

Foreword

My colleagues and I completed the first draft of the manuscript for this Deskbook shortly before the 2008 Presidential election. It had been many election cycles since environmental concerns were quite so prevalent in the national dialogue, with climate change and related energy issues front and center. That we were working on an issue at the crossroads of American political discourse gave purpose to our writing.

While large teams of lawyers frequently work collaboratively on major transactions or litigation, it is less frequent that so many contribute to a single piece of writing. It is safe to say that there has never been a collaboration of so many of my Paul *Hastings* environmental colleagues on a single matter as on this publication. Before we were done, 22 of us had a hand in it.

When we accepted the challenge to prepare a Deskbook on climate change for the Environmental Law Institute, we were generally aware of the myriad legal and policy implications of the topic and had counseled clients in various aspects of it. We probably did not, however, fully appreciate all its rich dimensions.

It seems ironic that Corporate Average Fuel Economy (CAFE) standards had nothing to do with reducing greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions when first enacted into law a generation ago. Yet the standards were at the center of efforts to bring about a change in public policy—given the delay in comprehensive federal climate change legislation—through litigation. Then, in 2007, amendments to the federal law creating CAFE standards had GHG emissions reductions as a focus. When you overlay National Environmental Policy Act requirements on top of CAFE standards, you get a fascinating exhibition of modern environmental law at work.

Environmental lawyers are generally aware of the various tax incentives for alternative and renewable energy sources. That is to be expected. Whenever the incentives are set to expire, articles about the investor uncertainty created by their limited terms appear in the trade press. Environmental lawyers are not as frequently reminded of the many ways in which the Internal Revenue Code encourages fossil fuel production and consumption. Comprehensive climate change policy has to take into account these aspects of tax policy.

As we were completing the manuscript, Rep. John D. Dingell (D-Mich.) laid down his "marker" for the next administration—his discussion draft of a comprehensive climate change bill. Always provocative, Representative Dingell proposed preempting state and regional climate change programs, where most progress toward regulating GHG emissions has been made in the first decade of the 21st century.

So we encountered many interesting twists and turns—some expected, some not—as we tackled this monumental topic. As we were preparing this manuscript, it also quickly became apparent that, by accepting the Institute's challenge to write the manuscript that became this publication, we signed up for inevitable subsequent editions. Not only does comprehensive federal legislation hold the prospect of materially altering the terrain, developments on many of the other fronts covered in this volume are equally susceptible to change.

As those developments continue to unfold, we trust this volume will provide a useful resource to its readers. We hope too that it contributes to improving the discourse as we collectively refine public policy in this area.

Tom Mounteer Washington, D.C. October 14, 2008

About the Authors

Tom Mounteer

Tom Mounteer, a partner in Paul Hastings' Washington office, helps businesses comply with state and federal environmental laws for controlling air and water pollution and for managing and cleaning up solid and hazardous waste. He helps buyers, sellers, and parties to financings identify, quantify, and allocate environmental liabilities associated with businesses and real estate. He also represents businesses before U.S. Congress and federal and state agencies in a wide range of environmental, health, and safety areas. Mr. Mounteer is the author of many scholarly and professional articles and a frequent speaker on a variety of environmental law topics. Since 1997, Mr. Mounteer has been an adjunct professor in the masters in environmental law program at George Washington University Law School.

Paul Hastings

Paul *Hastings* is an international law firm with 18 offices and more than 1,200 lawyers throughout Asia, Europe, and the United States. Paul Hastings' national environmental practitioners advise clients on all aspects of complex environmental matters, including technical and scientific issues, health-based risk assessments, political concerns, land use issues, litigation exposures, insurance issues, cleanup strategies, government agency interactions, regulatory requirements, and permitting issues. In 2008, combining numerous resources within the firm, Paul Hastings formally chartered its Sustainability and Global Climate Change Practice Group. This Practice Group allows the firm to approach its clients' sustainability issues comprehensively. The Sustainability and Global Climate Change Practice Group advises on renewable energy projects, regulatory compliance matters, and drafting legislation to ensure responsible use of resources at the international, national, and local level and assisting in the development of LEED-certified buildings.

Many members of the firm's Sustainability and Global Climate Change Practice Group contributed to the preparation of the Deskbook.

Partners

David Freeman, *New York* Lisa Rushton, *Washington*

Deborah Schmall, San Francisco Zack Walton, San Francisco

Associates

Jeff Allmon, Washington Eric Ensminger, Atlanta Sean Honeywill, Atlanta Laura Karvosky, New York Noah Perch-Ahern, Washington Matt Raeburn, Washington
Matthew Sanders, San Francisco
Jennifer Shea, Washington
Chi-Fei Wang, New York
Kevin Welsh, Washington

2008 Summer Associates

Jessica Almy, *New York*Rachel Birnbach, *New York*Christina Hardjasa, *Washington*Russell Johnson, *Washington*

Leslie Kersey, *New York*Michelle Litteken, *Washington*Nathan Moore, *San Francisco*