

October 22, 2012

The Honorable Tom Vilsack
Secretary, U.S. Department of Agriculture

The Honorable Steven Chu
Secretary, U.S. Department of Energy

The Honorable Leon Panetta
Secretary, U.S. Department of Defense

The Honorable Lisa Jackson
Administrator, U.S. Environmental
Protection Agency

The Honorable Ray LaHood
Secretary, U.S. Department of
Transportation

Dear Secretary Vilsack, Secretary Chu, Secretary Panetta, Administrator Jackson, and Secretary LaHood,

As scientists in the fields of ecology, wildlife biology, forestry, and natural resources, we are writing to bring your attention to the importance of working proactively to prevent potential ecological and economic damages associated with the potential spread of invasive bioenergy feedstocks. While we appreciate the steps that federal agencies have made to identify and promote renewable energy sources and to invest in second and third generation sources of bioenergy, we strongly encourage you to consider the invasive potential of all novel feedstock species, cultivars, and hybrids before providing incentives leading to their cultivation.

Studies have shown that some of the plants considered most promising in terms of bioenergy capacity may actually be highly invasive and potentially harmful to native species and ecosystems.^{1,2,3,4} In fact, many of the characteristics that make a plant appealing as an ideal source of biomass such as ease of establishment, rapid growth, resistance to pests and diseases, and low input requirements, are the same characteristics that make a plant more likely to become invasive.^{5,6} According to the non-federal members of Invasive Species Advisory Committee that provide independent advice to the National Invasive Species Council, “Absent strategic mitigation efforts, there is substantial risk that some biofuels crops will escape cultivation and cause socio-economic and/or ecological harm.”⁷

Many of today’s most problematic invasive plants – from kudzu to purple loosestrife – were intentionally imported and released into the environment for horticultural, agricultural, conservation, and forestry purposes. These invasive species already cost billions of dollars a year in the United States⁸ and are one of the primary threats to North America’s native species and ecosystems. It is imperative that we learn from our past mistakes by preventing intentional introduction of energy crops that may create the next invasive species catastrophe – particularly when introductions are funded by taxpayer dollars.

Under Executive Order 13112, a federal agency cannot “authorize, fund, or carry out actions that it believes are likely to cause or promote the introduction or spread of invasive species in the

United States or elsewhere unless, pursuant to guidelines that it has prescribed, the agency has determined and made public its determination that the benefits of such actions clearly outweigh the potential harm caused by invasive species; and that all feasible and prudent measures to minimize risk of harm will be taken in conjunction with the actions.”

To ensure ongoing compliance with the Executive Order and to prevent unintended consequences from the promotion of non-native and modified plants, algae, and microorganisms, we therefore request that federal agencies clearly assess the invasion risk of bioenergy feedstocks (including hybrids, varieties, genetically modified organisms, and cultivars) before these feedstocks can be eligible for federal incentives leading to their cultivation (through mandates, purchases, research grants, loans, and other means). Those species that may become invasive in the United States should be ineligible for incentives, unless the risk is low and, at a minimum, prudent measures are available and mandated to reduce the invasion risk and potential for harm. Tools for assessing the invasiveness of plant species and cultivars are widely available, including USDA APHIS’s newly revamped weed risk assessment.⁹ The National Invasive Species Council is best suited to coordinate this assessment process.

A thoughtful, consistent, proactive approach to sustainable bioenergy production that avoids potentially invasive feedstocks, while encouraging the development and implementation of new energy crops to meet U.S. renewable energy goals, would demonstrate wise stewardship of federal funds and serve to benefit the agencies in the long run. By assessing and reducing risks up front, we can minimize the potential for bioenergy crops that are promoted with taxpayer dollars to become invasive and cause harm to natural ecosystems. It is much cheaper and easier to take the steps to prevent an invasive escape than it is to deal with it after it has occurred.

Signed,

Richard N. Mack, Ph.D.
Washington State University
Pullman, WA

Bruce Robertson, Ph.D.
Bard College
Annandale-on-Hudson, NY

Dale Gawlik, Ph.D., Wildlife Sciences
President, FL Chapter of the Wildlife Society
Florida Atlantic University
Boca Raton, FL

James Miller, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Mississippi State University
Starkville, MS

Joseph M. DiTomaso, Ph.D.
University of California
Davis, CA

Scott L. Collins, Ph.D.
President, Ecological Society of America
Washington, DC

S. Raghu, Ph.D.
Stuttgart, AR

Lee Van Wychen, Ph.D.
Weed Science Society of America
Alexandria, VA

Dean Urban, Ph.D.
Duke University
Durham, NC

Adam M. Lambert, Ph.D.
Santa Barbara, CA

Elizabeth L. Middleton, Ph.D.
Missouri Department of Conservation
Clinton, MO

Kenneth Langeland, Ph.D.
Professor, University of Florida IFAS,
Agronomy Department and Center for Aquatic
and Invasive Plants
Gainesville, FL

Catherine A. McGlynn, Ph.D.
Northeast Illinois Invasive Plant Partnership
Chicago, IL

Donald C. Jackson, Ph.D., Fisheries
Mississippi State University
Mississippi State, MS

Douglas B. Inkley, Ph.D.
National Wildlife Federation
Reston, VA

Doria R Gordon, Ph.D.
The Nature Conservancy
Gainesville, FL

Emma Hampton, Ph.D., Zoology
University of Texas at Austin
Austin, TX

Rakesh S. Chandran, Ph.D.
Extension Weed Specialist & Professor
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV

Joseph Sirotnak, Ph.D., Ecology
Big Bend National Park
Big Bend, Texas

Loretta Battaglia, Ph.D., Ecology
Southern Illinois University
Carbondale, IL

Dawn Lawson, Ph.D., Ecology
San Diego, California

Matthew Olson, Ph.D., Forest Resources
West Plains, MO

F. Bryan Pickett, Ph.D., Genetics
Chicago, IL

Lizbeth Seebacher, Ph.D., Invasive Species
Biology
Washington State Department of Ecology
Lacey, WA

Lowell Pritchard Jr., Ph.D., Natural Resource
Economics
Creation Care Inc.
Decatur, GA

Jo Anna Heberger, Ph.D., Plant Ecology
Des Moines, IA

Alton Kinlaw, Ph.D., R.Ph.
Indiana University Health
Indianapolis, IN

Thomas Eubank, Ph.D., Weed Science
Mississippi State University
Stoneville, MS

William Faber, Ph.D., Wildlife Ecology
Central Lakes College
Brainerd, MN

Daniel C. Abel, Ph.D.
Coastal Carolina University
Conway, SC

Sarah Ward, Ph.D.
Colorado State University
Fort Collins, CO

Leonard Bull, Ph.D.
Cornell University
New Haven, VT

Antonio DiTommaso, Ph.D.
Cornell University
Ithaca, NY

John J. Jachetta, Ph.D.
Dow AgroSciences LLC
Indianapolis, IN

Sam Pearsall, Ph.D.
Environmental Defense Fund
Raleigh, NC

Margaret K. Thayer, Ph.D.
Field Museum of Natural History
Chicago, IL

Frank Powell, Ph.D.
Furman University
Seneca, SC

Daniel R. Ludwig, Ph.D.
Illinois Department of Natural Resources
Bartlett, IL

Heather L Reynolds, Ph.D.
Indiana University
Bloomington, IN

Vicky Meretsky, Ph.D.
Indiana University
Bloomington, IN

Angie Shelton, Ph.D.
Indiana University
Bloomington, IN

Chris Habeck, Ph.D.
Kutztown University
Kutztown, PA

Reuben Keller, Ph.D.
Loyola University, Chicago
Chicago, IL

Victor Maddox, Ph.D.
Mississippi Cooperative Weed Management
Area
Mississippi State, MS

David R. Shaw, Ph.D.
Mississippi State University
Miss. State, MS

John D. Byrd, Jr., Ph.D.
Mississippi State University
Mississippi State, MS

Bruce A. Stein, Ph.D.
National Wildlife Federation
Washington, DC

James T. Green, Jr., Ph.D.
North Carolina State University
Raleigh, NC

Kirk Howatt, Ph.D.
North Dakota State University
Fargo, ND

Daniel A. Ball, Ph.D.
Oregon State University
Pendleton, OR

Carol Mallory-Smith, Ph.D.
Oregon State University
Corvallis, OR

Thomas Wassmer, Ph.D.
Siena Heights University
Adrian, MI

William R. Eddleman, Ph.D.
Southeast Missouri State University
Cape Girardeau, MO

Christopher E. Comer, Ph.D.
Stephen F. Austin State University
Nacogdoches, TX

Li Kui, Ph.D.
SUNY-ESF
Syracuse, NY

Brian D. Carver, Ph.D.
Tennessee Technological University
Cookeville, TN

James R. Manhart, Ph.D.
Texas A&M University
College Station, TX

Scott Senseman, Ph.D.
Texas A&M University
College Station, TX

Peter Kareiva, Ph.D.
The Nature Conservancy
Seattle, WA

Kelly Lyons, Ph.D.
Trinity University
San Antonio, TX

Jodie S Holt, Ph.D.
University of California
Riverside, CA

Betsy Von Holle, Ph.D.
University of Central Florida
Orlando, FL

Vicki Jackson, Ph.D.
University of Central Missouri
Warrensburg, MO

Sarah Bois, Ph.D.
University of Connecticut
Storrs, CT

Mark VanGessel, Ph.D.
University of Delaware
Georgetown, DE

William A Overholt, Ph.D.
University of Florida
Fort Pierce, FL

Lyn Gettys, Ph.D.
University of Florida
Davie, FL

Jason Evans, Ph.D.
University of Georgia
Athens, GA

Donn Shilling, Ph.D.
University of Georgia
Athens, GA

Lauren Quinn, Ph.D.
University of Illinois
Urbana, IL

Peter Alpert, Ph.D.
University of Massachusetts, Amherst
Amherst, MA

Catherine Badgley, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI

L. Jack Lyon, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
Missoula, MT

Larry G. Visser, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI

Johannes Foufopoulos, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI

Michael R. Moore, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI

Ivette Perfecto, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI

William S. Currie, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI

Daniel Tufford, Ph.D.
University of South Carolina
Columbia, SC

Norma Fowler, Ph.D.
University of Texas
Austin, TX

Sarah Reichard, Ph.D.
University of Washington Botanic Gardens
Seattle, WA

Joy B. Zedler, Ph.D.
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI

Philip A. Fay, Ph.D.
USDA-ARS
Temple, TX

John Fike, Ph.D.
Virginia Tech
Blacksburg, VA

Paul E. Bartelt, Ph.D.
Waldorf College
Forest City, IA

M. Jahi Chappell, Ph.D.
Washington State University, Vancouver
Vancouver, WA

Kashka Kubzdela, Ph.D.
Oakton, VA

Charles P. Nicholson, Ph.D.
Norris, TN

Jeff Levensgood, Ph.D.
Champaign, IL

Jean O'Neil, Ph.D.
W. Hatfield, MA

Ron Carroll, Ph.D.
Athens, GA

Ruth Douglas, Ph.D.
Charlottesville, VA

Matt Bahm, Ph.D.
Spokane, WA

Lesli Hoey, Ph.D.
Ann Arbor, MI

Robin Goodloe, Ph.D.
Athens, GA

David L. Davidson, Ph.D.
San Antonio, TX

Paul H. Meredith, Ph.D.
Victoria, TX

Mary R. Meredith, Ph.D.
Victoria, TX

John Tirpak, Ph.D.
Lafayette, LA

Kathryn Kavanagh, Ph.D.
Austin, TX

Robert Kamper, Ph.D.
Round Rock, TX

Rachel Schultz, Ph.D.
Plattsburgh, NY

Jeanne Jones, Ph.D.
Louisville, MS

Susan P. Rupp, Ph.D.
Brookings, SD

Georgianne Moore, Ph.D.
College Station, TX

Jill Schroeder, Ph.D.
Las Cruces, NM

Iñigo Granzow-de la Cerda, Ph.D.
Ann Arbor, MI

Jonathan Ambrose, Ph.D.
Watkinsville, GA

Judith Breland, Ph.D.
Wiggins, MS

Rodney Lym, Ph.D.
Fargo, ND

Barry J. Brecke, Ph.D.
Milton, FL

Roger E. Gast, Ph.D.
Zionsville, IN

Jessica Hite, Ph.D. Candidate
Indiana University
Bloomington, IN

Bryan Tarbox, Ph.D. Candidate
Gainesville, FL

Sarah Fritts, Ph.D. Candidate
North Carolina State University
Raleigh, NC

Heidi L Springborn
Natural Resources Technican
Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources
Green Bay, WI

Jenn Truong, MNR
Fairfax, VA

Tamara Johnson, MNR
GA

Susan Kenzle, MLA
American Society of Landscape Architects
Austin, TX

Roy B. Mann, MLA
Harvard Graduate School of Design
Cambridge, MA

Jason Hodges, MLA
Texas Tech University
Lubbock, TX

Sam Rogers, MLA
University of Tennessee
Knoxville, TN

Darcy Nuffer, MLA
University of Texas
Austin, TX

Ariel Shaw, MLA
San Francisco, CA

Doug Johnson, M.S., M.A.
California Invasive Plant Council
Berkeley, CA

Kathy Schwager, M.S., Ecology
Certified Ecologist
Patchogue, NY

Eamonn Leonard, M.S., Plant Ecology
Georgia Department of Natural Resources
Brunswick, GA

Frank Hassler, M.S., Forestry
Good Oak Ecological Services
Madison, WI

Steven C. Garske, M.S., Plant Ecology
Great Lakes Indian Fish & Wildlife
Commission
Odanah, WI

Patricia Clifford, M.S., Natural Resource
Planning
Hawaii-Pacific Weed Risk Assessment
Honolulu, HI

Aaron Yetter, M.S., Zoology
Illinois Natural History Survey
Havana, IL

Shawna L. Bautista, M.S., Zoology &
Physiology
Invasive Plant Program Manager
USDA Forest Service
Portland, OR

Donna Beliech, M.S., Horticulture
President of the MS Assn. of Co. Ag. Agents
(MACAA)
Mississippi State University
Brandon, MS

Susan Farrington, M.S., Forest Ecology
Missouri Department of Conservation
West Plains, MO

Aaron Stevenson, M.S., Forest Ecology
Missouri Department of Conservation
West Plains, MO

Timothy Banek, M.S., Biology
Missouri Department of Conservation
Jefferson City, MO

Terry L. Goldsby, M.S., Botany
Northwestern State University of Louisiana
Guntersville, AL

Lindsey Wise, M.S., Ecology
Portland State University
Portland, OR

Carole Gernes, M.S., Biology
Ramsey County Cooperative Weed
Management Area
Little Canada, MN

Pete Jackson, M.S., Biology
U.S. EPA
Chicago, IL

Jill Hardiman, M.S., Fish and Wildlife
Biology
United States Geological Survey
Cook, WA

Jennifer J Buck, M.S., Plant Science
University of California, Davis
Nevada City, CA

Kandarpa Cousineau, M.S., Inorganic
Chemistry
University of Michigan
Los Angeles, CA

Ted Seiler, M.S., Wildlife Biology
University of Missouri
Macon, MO

Leslie Harman, M.S., Geology
University of Missouri
Columbia, MO

Pat Parr, M.S., Ecology
University of Tennessee
Oak Ridge, TN

Glen Buckner, M.S., Ecology and
Environmental Science
Will County Forest Preserve
Joliet, IL

Timothy Burr, M.S., Zoology
Poway, CA

Karen Viste-Sparkman, M.S., Wildlife
Science
Des Moines, IA

Sylvia Copeland, M.S., Wildlife Science
Nampa, ID

Kristen Aaltonen, M.S., Wildlife Ecology and
Conservation
Austin, TX

Lowell H. Suring, M.S., Wildlife Ecology
Suring, WI

Chris Newbold, M.S., Wildlife Biology
Columbia, MO

Mary Ellen Kustin, M.S., Sustainable
Development and Conservation Biology
Riverdale, MD

Reed Sanderson, M.S., Range Management
Green Valley, AZ

Elizabeth Colket, M.S., Range Ecology and
Management
Boise, Idaho

Sandra Birnbaum, M.S., Population &
Conservation Biology
Austin, TX

Alison Robbins, M.S., D.V.M.
Boston, MA

A. Strong, M.S., Botany
Austin, TX

Leon Bates, M.S., Botany
Benton, TN

Darby Niswonger, M.S., Biology
Chillicothe, MO

Bill McGuire, M.S., Biology
Jefferson City, MO

Charles Kowaleski, M.S., Biology
Salado, Texas

Karen Kreil, M.S., Biology
Bismarck, ND

Alexandra Wrobel, M.S., Applied Ecology
Ashland, WI

Rebecca Swadek, M.S.
Carrollton, TX

Michael Daab, M.S.
Champaign County Forest Preserve
Champaign, IL

Vanelle Peterson, M.S.
Dow AgroSciences LLC
Mulino, OR

Lindsay D. Leverett, M.S.
Duke University
Durham, NC

David Kyler, M.S.
Executive Director, Center for a Sustainable
Coast
Saint Simons Island, GA

Chris Buddenhagen, M.S.
Florida State University
Tallahassee, FL

Chris Lockhart, M.S.
Habitat Specialists, Inc.
Boynton Beach, FL

Charles Chimera, M.S.
Hawaii-Pacific Weed Risk Assessment
Makawao, HI

Ward Bloodworth, M.S.
Mississippi Ag Industry Council
Madison, MS

Amanda Walker, M.S.
Mississippi State University
Monticello, MS

Michael Cove, M.S.
North Carolina State University
Raleigh, NC

David Watts, M.S.
Texas A&M University
State College, PA

Jack LeClair, M.S.
Texas A&M University-Kingsville
Kingsville, TX

Jessica Strickland, M.S.
Texas State University
San Marcos, TX

Michael Lusk, M.S.
The Wildlife Society
Crystal River, FL

Kai Umeda, M.S.
University of Arizona
Phoenix, AZ

Rob Proulx, M.S.
University of Minnesota
Crookston, MN

Jim Eckberg, M.S.
University of Minnesota
Saint Paul, MN

Merel R. Black, M.S.
University of Wisconsin- Stevens Point
Stevens Point, WI

Kevin Hurley, M.S.
University of Wyoming
Laramie, WY

Matthew Kaproth, M.S.
West Virginia University
Burlington, VT

Vern Holm, M.S.
Western Invasives Network
McMinnville, OR

Theodore Cochrane, M.S.
Wisconsin State Herbarium
Madison, WI

Gerry Steinauer, M.S.
Aurora, NE

Carey Strobel, M.S.
Austwell, TX

Janene Lichtenberg, M.S.
Polson, MT

Mike Livingston, M.S.
Prosser, WA

Martha Gruelle, M.S.
Detroit, MI

Rebecca Schillo, M.S.
Chicago, IL

Landon Vine, M.S.
Denver, CO

Bridget Collins, M.S.
Washington, DC

Kenny Ribbeck, M.S.
Baton Rouge, LA

Fan Li, M.S.
Houston, TX

Steve Winters, M.Ag.
Mississippi State University
Grenada, MS

Monique De Vries, M.Ag.
New Mexico State University
San Antonio, TX

Eric David Boyda
Appalachian Ohio Weed Control Partnership
Pedro, OH

Aviva Glaser, M.S., Conservation Biology
Baltimore, MD

Betty Mading
Lady Bird Johnson Wildflower Center
Austin, TX

Robert Clancy
Michigan Department of Natural Resources
Lansing, MI

Kenneth Calcote
Mississippi Department of Agriculture &
Commerce
Mississippi State, MS

Dan Drees
National Park Service
Van Buren, MO

Benjy Strobe,
NC Wildlife Resources Commission
White Oak, NC

Greg J. Wall,
President, Mississippi Vegetation
Management Association
Helena Chemical Company
Sturgis, MS

CC: Heather Zichal, Deputy Assistant to the President for Energy and Climate Change
Lori Williams, Executive Director of the National Invasive Species Council
Jeffrey Zients, Acting Director of the Office of Management and Budget

¹ Raghu, S., R.C. Anderson, C.C. Daehler, A.S. Davis, R.N. Wiedenmann, D. Simberloff, and R.N. Mack. 2006. Adding biofuels to the invasive species fire? *Science* 313: 1742.

² DiTomaso, J.M., J.M. Barney, and A.M. Fox. 2007. Biofuel feedstocks: the risk of future invasions. Council for Agricultural Science and Technology Commentary, QTA 2007-1.

<http://www.fs.fed.us/ficmnew/documents/notices/Biofuels2007.pdf> (accessed March 12, 2012).

³ Barney, J.N. and J.M. DiTomaso. 2008 Nonnative species and bioenergy: Are we cultivating the next invader? *BioScience* 58: 64-70.

⁴ Low, T., C. Booth, and A. Sheppard. 2011. Weedy biofuels: What can be done? *Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability* 3: 55-59.

⁵ Witt, A. 2011. Biofuels as Invasive Species. *CABI Expert White Paper Series on Biofuels*.

⁶ Raghu, et al. 2006.

⁷ Invasive Species Advisory Committee (ISAC). 2009. *Biofuels: Cultivating Energy, not Invasive Species*.

⁸ Pimentel, D., L. Lach, R. Zuniga, and D. Morrison. 2000. Environmental and economic costs associated with non-indigenous species in the United States. *BioScience* 50: 53-65.

⁹ Koop, AL, L Fowler, LP Newton, and BP Caton. 2011. Development and validation of a weed screening tool for the United States. *Biol. Invasions* 14: 273-294.